

The 2014 Committee of Visitors: Status

Amitava Bhattacharjee

Princeton Plasma Physics
Laboratory, Princeton University

FESAC Meeting, September 23, 2014

- **What**—A panel to assess the efficacy and quality of the processes used to solicit, review, recommend, monitor, and document funding actions and to assess the quality of the resulting portfolio
 - The national and international standings of the programs' sub-elements are part of the evaluation of the breadth and depth of the portfolio
- **Who**—Each COV panel is composed of a group of recognized scientists and research program leaders with broad expertise in the designated program areas
- **When**—Each program element must be reviewed once every three years
- **Why**—To ensure quality and fairness and to help foster improvements
- **Where**—A two- to three-day visit to DOE Germantown to review documents and meet with DOE program managers



Office of Science

Further information about COVs

- The Director of the Office of Science charges the relevant advisory committees to assemble COVs to assess the Office of Science programs on a regular basis.
- Every program element must be reviewed by a COV at least once every three years.
- The portfolio under review by a COV generally includes all actions – both awards and declinations – for universities, national laboratories, and industry administered by the program for a set period of time, usually three years
- The COV prepares a report, which is presented to the full Federal Advisory Committee at a public meeting. The Federal Advisory Committee reviews and may make modifications to the report prior to acceptance. Following acceptance, the report is transmitted to the Director of the Office of Science and released publicly.
- The Associate Director of the Office of Science in charge of the program element under review provides a response to the review within 30 days of the acceptance of the report by the Federal Advisory Committee.

- **Membership**
 - The COV panel should be composed of recognized scientists and research group leaders with broad expertise relevant to the fusion program.
- **Conflict of interest**
 - Panel members should be familiar with FES research programs; however, a significant fraction of the COV members should not be involved in research that is being funded by FES.
 - Each panel member will be requested to sign a Conflict of Interest statement and a Confidentiality statement.

Requirements for COV members

- COV members must keep confidential the names and comments of reviewers and information related to awards/declinations.
- COV members will not review any application, proposal or action with which they have been determined to have a conflict of interest (e.g., reviewing funding requests from their own institutions, or ones in which they are collaborators, or funding requests for which they were reviewers).

COV Relation to the Federal Advisory Committee

- The Federal Advisory Committee (FAC) operates in accordance with the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA). *A COV is a subcommittee that reports to the FAC rather than to the agency.*
- As such, the COV is not subject to the procedural requirements of the FACA (e.g., COV meetings are not announced in the Federal Register and are not required to be open to the public.)

Charge from Dr. P. Dehmer to Prof. M. Koepke, April 8, 2014

I am writing to request that the Fusion Energy Sciences Advisory Committee (FESAC) establish a Committee of Visitors (COV) to review the management processes of the Department of Energy Office of Science Fusion Energy Sciences (FES) program. The panel should consider and provide evaluation of:

- The efficiency and quality of the processes used by FES to solicit, review, recommend, monitor, and document awards and declinations for universities, national laboratories, and industry.
- The breadth, depth, and quality of the resulting program portfolio, and providing an evaluation of the program's national and international standing.
- FES's management of its portfolio of line item construction and Major Items of Equipment projects, including the U.S. Contributions to ITER project. Assessment of FES projects' performance, including contractor and Federal Project Director management of projects, is performed by periodic Office of Science Independent Project Reviews, and is not part of this COV.



Office of Science

More on COV scope

- **Period for evaluation**
 - The last COV activity evaluated the FES program through FY 2009.
 - Accordingly, in this assessment the COV should review the entire FES program for activities during FY 2010, FY 2011, FY 2012, and FY 2013.
- **Action items**
 - The panel should also comment on FES's progress in addressing action items from the previous COV review.

2014 COV Members

- William Amatucci, NRL (Experiment)
- Joseph Arango, JLAB (Project Management)
- Amitava Bhattacharjee, PPPL/Princeton University, Chair (Theory/Computation)
- Russ Doerner, UCSD (Experiment)
- David Gates, PPPL (Experiment)
- Jerry Hughes, MIT (Experiment)
- Alice Koniges, LBNL (Theory/Computation)
- Richard Kurtz, PNNL (Enabling Technology)
- Brian Nelson, University of Washington (Experiment)
- Mark Nornberg, University of Wisconsin-Madison (Experiment)
- Mark Reichanadter, SLAC (Project Management)
- Robert Rosner, University of Chicago (HEDP, Theory/Computation)
- John Tapia, LANL (Project Management)
- Richard Temkin, MIT (Enabling Technology)
- Steven Vincena, PPPL (Experiment)



U.S. DEPARTMENT OF
ENERGY

Office of Science

Past COV reports for FES

Date of report	Scope	COV chair	Date of FES response
March 2004	Theory and Computation	William Nevins	May 20, 2004
April 2005	Innovative Confinement, General Plasma Physics, and Inertial Confinement	Jeffrey Freidberg	April 26, 2005
May 2006	Tokamak Research and Enabling Technologies	Kathryn McCarthy	June 12, 2006
April 2010	FES program (excluding MIE projects)	Rulon Linford	December 15, 2010

Topics to be reviewed

- Theory and Simulation (including SciDACs)
- MFE Experimental Research: (i) ITER and AT Optimization, (ii) FNSF Science Basis, (iii) 3D Topologies
- Fusion Materials and Technology
- Discovery Science and Joint Programs: (i) HEDLP/IFE Science, (ii) General Plasma Science
- ITER Project/Domestic Constructions Project

Process/Schedule

- COV meeting at Germantown, December 2-4, 2014. (All members must attend, no participation by teleconference is permitted. A critical number of OFES Program Managers will attend.)
- Prior to meeting in Germantown, COV members will meet by telecon(s) in October/November. A.B. to visit OFES/DOE in October/November to plan details of the review.
- Dr. Dehmer's charge letter asked that FESAC submit a report on the COV activity by January, 2015. (This might be difficult, and a request for extension is likely.)
- DOE point of contact: S. Barish
- Please feel free to contact me with concerns/questions: amitava@princeton.edu, amitava@pppl.gov